# Towards Empirical Process Theory for Vector-Valued Functions: Metric Entropy of Smooth Function Classes

#### Junhyung Park, Krikamol Muandet

Max Plank Institute for Intelligent Systems, Tübingen CISPA Helmholtz Center for Information Security, Saarbrücken

**ALT 2023** 

Motivation

Contributions

- There is a growing literature on learning vector-valued functions:
  - multi-task or multi-output learning;
  - functional response models;
  - kernel conditional mean embeddings;
  - structured prediction;
  - •

- There is a growing literature on learning vector-valued functions:
  - multi-task or multi-output learning;
  - functional response models;
  - kernel conditional mean embeddings;
  - structured prediction;
  - •
- [Micchelli and Pontil, 2005], [Alvarez, 2011] Algorithm for learning vector-valued functions using operator-valued kernels.

- There is a growing literature on learning vector-valued functions:
  - multi-task or multi-output learning;
  - functional response models;
  - kernel conditional mean embeddings;
  - structured prediction;
  - :
- [Micchelli and Pontil, 2005], [Alvarez, 2011] Algorithm for learning vector-valued functions using operator-valued kernels.
- [Caponnetto and de Vito, 2007], [Ciliberto et al., 2020], [Cabannes et al., 2021], [Singh et al., 2019] Learning rates using integral operator techniques for kernel methods.

- There is a growing literature on learning vector-valued functions:
  - multi-task or multi-output learning;
  - functional response models;
  - kernel conditional mean embeddings;
  - structured prediction;
  - :
- [Micchelli and Pontil, 2005], [Alvarez, 2011] Algorithm for learning vector-valued functions using operator-valued kernels.
- [Caponnetto and de Vito, 2007], [Ciliberto et al., 2020], [Cabannes et al., 2021], [Singh et al., 2019] Learning rates using integral operator techniques for kernel methods.
- [Yousefi et al., 2018], [Li et al., 2019] Vector-valued extension of Rademacher complexities.

#### Empirical Process Theory for Vector-Valued Functions

• Empirical process theory is concerned with the empirical measure  $P_n = \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n \delta_{X_i}$ , and the stochastic process of the form  $\{P_n f - Pf : f \in \mathcal{F}\}$ .

#### Empirical Process Theory for Vector-Valued Functions

- Empirical process theory is concerned with the empirical measure  $P_n = \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n \delta_{X_i}$ , and the stochastic process of the form  $\{P_n f Pf : f \in \mathcal{F}\}$ .
- For example, we're interested in questions such as whether

$$\sup_{f\in\mathcal{F}}\left|\frac{1}{n}\sum_{i=1}^n f(X_i)-\mathbb{E}[f(X)]\right|\stackrel{P}{\to} 0.$$

### Empirical Process Theory for Vector-Valued Functions

- Empirical process theory is concerned with the empirical measure  $P_n = \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n \delta_{X_i}$ , and the stochastic process of the form  $\{P_n f Pf : f \in \mathcal{F}\}$ .
- For example, we're interested in questions such as whether

$$\sup_{f\in\mathcal{F}}\left|\frac{1}{n}\sum_{i=1}^n f(X_i)-\mathbb{E}[f(X)]\right|\stackrel{P}{\to} 0.$$

• For a class  $\mathcal G$  of functions  $g:\mathcal X\to\mathcal Y$ , where  $\mathcal Y$  is a Hilbert space, we are interested in questions such as whether

$$\sup_{g\in\mathcal{G}}\left\|\frac{1}{n}\sum_{i=1}^ng(X_i)-\mathbb{E}[g(X)]\right\|_{\mathcal{V}}\stackrel{P}{\to} 0.$$

# Metric Entropy

• Suppose  $(\mathcal{Z}, \rho)$  is a metric space. For any  $\delta > 0$ , the  $\delta$ -covering number of  $(\mathcal{Z}, \rho)$ , denoted by  $N(\delta, \mathcal{Z}, \rho)$ , is the minimum number of balls of radius  $\delta$  with centres in  $\mathcal{Z}$  required to cover  $\mathcal{Z}$ . We define the  $\delta$ -entropy as  $H(\delta, \mathcal{Z}, \rho) = \log N(\delta, \mathcal{Z}, \rho)$ .

# Metric Entropy – Complexity of Function Classes

- For real-valued functions, the following classes of functions have been identified to have good bounds on their metric entropies:
  - Finite-dimensional classes;
  - Classes of smooth functions;
  - Classes of functions of bounded variation;
  - Classes of concave functions;
  - •

# Metric Entropy – Complexity of Function Classes

- For real-valued functions, the following classes of functions have been identified to have good bounds on their metric entropies:
  - Finite-dimensional classes;
  - Classes of smooth functions;
  - Classes of functions of bounded variation;
  - Classes of concave functions;
  - :
- Other measures of complexity also exist, such as the VC dimension and entropy with bracketing.

# Metric Entropy – Complexity of Function Classes

- For real-valued functions, the following classes of functions have been identified to have good bounds on their metric entropies:
  - Finite-dimensional classes;
  - Classes of smooth functions;
  - Classes of functions of bounded variation;
  - Classes of concave functions;
  - :
- Other measures of complexity also exist, such as the VC dimension and entropy with bracketing.
- For vector-valued function classes, investigations on their metric entropies have not received much attention.

### Entropy of Vector-Valued Function Classes

#### Challenges

• If  $\mathcal{Y}$  is infinite-dimensional, seemingly trivial function classes such as the class of constant functions onto the unit ball,

$$\mathcal{G} = \{g(x) = y \text{ for all } x \in \mathcal{X} : y \in \mathcal{Y}, ||y||_{\mathcal{Y}} \le 1\}$$

have infinite entropy.

### Entropy of Vector-Valued Function Classes

#### Challenges

• If  $\mathcal{Y}$  is infinite-dimensional, seemingly trivial function classes such as the class of constant functions onto the unit ball,

$$\mathcal{G} = \{g(x) = y \text{ for all } x \in \mathcal{X} : y \in \mathcal{Y}, ||y||_{\mathcal{Y}} \le 1\}$$

have infinite entropy.

• To have any chance, it is clear that the output range has to be restricted in more than the norm sense.

# Set-Up

• Let  $\mathcal X$  be any input domain, and let the output space  $\mathcal Y$  be a *(not necessarily finite-dimensional) Hilbert space.* 

# Set-Up

- Let  $\mathcal X$  be any input domain, and let the output space  $\mathcal Y$  be a *(not necessarily finite-dimensional) Hilbert space.*
- Let  $\mathcal G$  be a class of Bochner-integrable functions  $g:\mathcal X\to\mathcal Y.$

# Set-Up

- Let  $\mathcal X$  be any input domain, and let the output space  $\mathcal Y$  be a *(not necessarily finite-dimensional) Hilbert space.*
- Let  $\mathcal G$  be a class of Bochner-integrable functions  $g:\mathcal X \to \mathcal Y.$
- Let X be a random variable taking values in  $\mathcal{X}$ , and  $X_1, X_2, ...$  i.i.d. copies of it.

#### Fractal Dimensions

• Let *E* be a subset of  $(\mathcal{Z}, \rho)$ . The *upper box-counting* dimension of *E* is

$$\tau_{\mathsf{box}}(E) := \limsup_{\delta \to 0} \frac{H(\delta, E, \rho)}{-\log \delta}.$$

#### Fractal Dimensions

• Let *E* be a subset of  $(\mathcal{Z}, \rho)$ . The *upper box-counting* dimension of *E* is

$$\tau_{\mathsf{box}}(E) := \limsup_{\delta \to 0} \frac{H(\delta, E, \rho)}{-\log \delta}.$$

• A subset E of  $(\mathcal{Z}, \rho)$  is said to be  $(M, \tau)$ -homogeneous (or simply homogeneous) if the intersection of E with any closed ball of radius R can be covered by at most  $M\left(\frac{R}{r}\right)^{\tau}$  closed balls of smaller radius r.

- Let  $m, d \in \mathbb{N}$ ,  $B \subset \mathcal{Y}$  and  $\mathcal{X}$  the unit cube in  $\mathbb{R}^d$ .
- Let  $\mathcal{G}_B^m$  be the set of m-times differentiable functions  $g:\mathcal{X}\to\mathcal{Y}$  such that:
  - partial derivatives  $D^pg: \mathcal{X} \to \mathcal{Y}$  of orders  $[p] \leq m$  exist everywhere on the interior of  $\mathcal{X}$ , and
  - $D^p g(x) \in B$  for all  $x \in \mathcal{X}$  and  $[p] \leq m$ .

- Let  $m, d \in \mathbb{N}$ ,  $B \subset \mathcal{Y}$  and  $\mathcal{X}$  the unit cube in  $\mathbb{R}^d$ .
- Let  $\mathcal{G}_B^m$  be the set of m-times differentiable functions  $g:\mathcal{X}\to\mathcal{Y}$  such that:
  - partial derivatives  $D^pg: \mathcal{X} \to \mathcal{Y}$  of orders  $[p] \leq m$  exist everywhere on the interior of  $\mathcal{X}$ , and
  - $D^p g(x) \in B$  for all  $x \in \mathcal{X}$  and  $[p] \leq m$ .

#### Theorem 4

Let  $B\subset \mathcal{Y}$  be totally bounded and  $(M, \tau_{\mathsf{asd}})$ -homogeneous. Then for sufficiently small  $\delta>0$ , there exists some constant K depending on  $K_B$ , m, d, M and  $\tau_{\mathsf{asd}}$  such that

$$H\left(\delta, \mathcal{G}_{B}^{m}, \|\cdot\|_{\infty}\right) \leq K\delta^{-\frac{d}{m}}.$$

#### Theorem 5

Let B be a subset of  $\mathcal Y$  with finite upper box-counting dimension  $\tau_{\mathrm{box}}$ . Then for sufficiently small  $\delta>0$ , there exists some constant K depending on  $K_B$ , m, d and  $\tau_{\mathrm{box}}$  such that

$$H\left(\delta,\mathcal{G}_{B}^{m},\|\cdot\|_{\infty}\right)\leq K\delta^{-\frac{d}{m}}\log\left(\frac{1}{\delta}\right).$$

#### Theorem 5

Let B be a subset of  $\mathcal Y$  with finite upper box-counting dimension  $au_{\mathrm{box}}$ . Then for sufficiently small  $\delta>0$ , there exists some constant K depending on  $K_B$ , m, d and  $au_{\mathrm{box}}$  such that

$$H\left(\delta, \mathcal{G}_{B}^{m}, \|\cdot\|_{\infty}\right) \leq K\delta^{-\frac{d}{m}}\log\left(\frac{1}{\delta}\right).$$

#### Theorem 6

Let B be a subset of  $\mathcal Y$  with  $N(\epsilon,B,\|\cdot\|_{\mathcal Y}) \leq \exp\{M\epsilon^{-\tau_{\exp}}\}$  for some  $M,\tau_{\exp}>0$ . Then for sufficiently small  $\delta>0$ , there is some constant K depending on  $K_B$ , m, d, M and  $\tau_{\exp}$  such that

$$H\left(\delta, \mathcal{G}_{B}^{m}, \|\cdot\|_{\infty}\right) \leq K\delta^{-\left(\frac{d}{m} + \tau_{\exp}\right)}.$$

# **Applications**

• Uniform law of large numbers of  $\mathcal{G}_B^m$  for B satisfying any of the previous theorems.

# Applications

- Uniform law of large numbers of  $\mathcal{G}_B^m$  for B satisfying any of the previous theorems.
- Regression with smooth functions, where the output space itself consists of smooth (real-valued) functions, or any other real-valued function classes with appropriately bounded entropies.

# **Applications**

- Uniform law of large numbers of  $\mathcal{G}_B^m$  for B satisfying any of the previous theorems.
- Regression with smooth functions, where the output space itself consists of smooth (real-valued) functions, or any other real-valued function classes with appropriately bounded entropies.
- Kernel conditional mean embeddings, where the outputs consist of functions taking values in an RKHS.

 Despite the growth of literature on vector-valued learning, empirical process theory only exists for real-valued functions.

- Despite the growth of literature on vector-valued learning, empirical process theory only exists for real-valued functions.
- Our work attempts to make some first steps in developing empirical process theory for vector-valued functions.

- Despite the growth of literature on vector-valued learning, empirical process theory only exists for real-valued functions.
- Our work attempts to make some first steps in developing empirical process theory for vector-valued functions.
- Future directions:
  - entropy of function classes other than those of smooth functions;
  - infinite-dimensional input spaces;
  - uniform central limit theorems;
  - lower bounds... and many more.